

The December 2023 Cobre Valley Institute of Technology performance audit found that the District spent \$1.4 million on career and technical education (CTE) programs in fiscal year 2021 but lacked key outcome data showing these programs effectively prepared students for high-need occupations. We made 2 recommendations to the District, and its status in implementing the recommendations is as follows:

Status of 2 recommendations

In process	1
Not yet applicable	1

We will conduct an 18-month followup with the District on the status of the recommendations that have not yet been implemented.

Finding 1: District’s lack of key outcome data prevents it from demonstrating how the \$1.4 million it spent on programs in fiscal 2021 effectively prepared students for high-need occupations

1. The District should develop and implement consistent data collection protocols for all CTE programs to demonstrate compliance with statutory and ADE requirements and recommended practices. This includes collecting and validating complete data, such as data related to student certifications earned and post-graduate jobs obtained, as well as developing a process to track all outcome data.

Implementation in process—The District has begun taking steps to develop and implement consistent data collection protocols across its central and satellite CTE programs. Specifically, in July 2024, the District hosted a meeting with its member districts to discuss the District’s data collection requirements and its planned process for validating and analyzing the data, including student certifications earned and post-graduate jobs obtained. According to the District, it plans to hold these meetings quarterly. However, as of July 2024, the District had not developed consistent data collection protocols guiding its and its member districts’ data collection efforts, which District officials reported has resulted in the District and its member districts continuing to collect data inconsistently. District officials stated that it plans to audit each member district’s reported outcome data by February 2025 to validate its accuracy and will conduct these audits annually thereafter. The District then plans to analyze the validated data to evaluate the effectiveness of its CTE programs. Finally, the District reported it will require member districts to revise and resubmit outcome data to ADE if the District identifies inaccuracies during its review. We will review the District’s data collection and validation efforts at the 18-month followup.

2. The District should analyze all CTE program outcome data to evaluate the effectiveness of its CTE programs in preparing students for high-need occupations and to support the investment of any public monies, and use the results of its evaluations to make changes to its programs to ensure they are meeting their statutory purpose of preparing students for high-need occupations.

Not yet applicable—As stated in recommendation 1, the District has begun developing a process for it and its member districts to consistently collect, validate, and report student outcome data and plans to use this data to evaluate its CTE programs’ effectiveness. District officials reported that they plan to evaluate each CTE program’s effectiveness by comparing yearly data to identify potential declines in certifications earned or CTE program-related job placements. Additionally, the District stated it will use data to determine whether its CTE programs met

State-determined performance levels.¹ According to District officials, if its analysis identifies any CTE programs with poor outcomes or programs performing below State-determined performance levels, the District will provide these programs with additional support, such as creating a performance-improvement plan, to improve outcomes before considering discontinuing such programs. Because the District is still in the process of collecting the outcome data needed to evaluate its CTE programs' effectiveness in preparing students for jobs in high-need occupations, we will continue to assess the District's efforts to implement this recommendation at the 18-month followup.

¹ The State-determined levels of performance for each measure are included in the State's *Perkins V State Plan* that ADE submits to the U.S. Department of Education for review and approval.